

Електронний журнал «Ефективна економіка» включено до переліку наукових фахових видань України з питань економіки (Категорія «Б», Наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України № 975 від 11.07.2019). Спеціальності – 051, 071, 072, 073, 075, 076, 292.
Ефективна економіка. 2024. № 8.

DOI: <http://doi.org/10.32702/2307-2105.2024.8.61>

УДК 330.341

*I. Androshchuk,
PhD in Economics, Associate Professor of the Department of Economy,
Management and Commercial Activity,
Central Ukrainian National Technical University
ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2232-8061>
O. Shchelnyk,
Assistant of the Department of Economy, Management and Commercial Activity,
Central Ukrainian National Technical University
ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0002-3544-8721>
M. Horpynchenko,
PhD student of the Department of Economy, Management and Commercial
Activity, Central Ukrainian National Technical University
ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0003-9925-6048>*

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROGRESSIVE APPROACHES TO QUALITY MANAGEMENT IN HEIS: BEST PRACTICES OF FOREIGN COUNTRIES

*I. О. Андрощук,
к. е. н., доцент, доцент кафедри економіки, менеджменту та комерційної
діяльності, Центральноукраїнський національний технічний університет,
О. В. Щельник,
асистент кафедри економіки, менеджменту та комерційної діяльності,
Цentrальноукраїнський національний технічний університет,
М. В. Горпинченко,
аспірант кафедри економіки, менеджменту та комерційної діяльності,
Цentrальноукраїнський національний технічний університет,*

ВПРОВАДЖЕННЯ ПРОГРЕСИВНИХ ПІДХОДІВ ДО МЕНЕДЖМЕНТУ ЯКОСТІ У ЗАКЛАДАХ ВИЩОЇ ОСВІТИ: КРАЩИЙ ДОСВІД ЗАРУБІЖНИХ КРАЇН

Стаття присвячена дослідженню процесу впровадження прогресивних підходів до менеджменту якості у закладах вищої освіти, зокрема зарубіжному досвіду у цьому напрямку. Авторами досліджено етапи процесу створення системи управління якістю ISO 9001-2000 в сучасних університетах, які базуються на дослідженні досвіду зарубіжних країн. Проведено порівняльний аналіз переліку факторів, що впливають на якість освіти в контексті вивчення принципів TQM, критеріїв EFQM та вимог міжнародного стандарту ISO 9001. Здійснено аналіз позитивного досвіду розвинених країн щодо впровадження принципів загального менеджменту якості відповідно до вимог системи якості ISO 9001:2000. Констатовано, що впровадження систем менеджменту якості в ЗВО дає змогу підвищити конкурентоспроможність випускників на ринку праці у національному та міжнародному контексті. Авторами проаналізовано основні етапи створення системи управління якістю у закладах вищої освіти, серед яких: створення групи для формування політики якості та опису основних процесів у ЗВО; навчання та мотивація персоналу закладу, навчання уповноважених з якості, менеджерів та аудиторів; розробка (проектування) системи, що дозволяє ефективно управляти процесами, діями та завданнями на всіх рівнях; розвиток системи внутрішнього аудиту; впровадження системи управління якістю надання освітніх послуг. Авторами здійснено порівняльний аналіз підходів до моніторингу якості вищої освіти в більшості країнах Європи та Україні. Серед основних переваг впровадження систем управління якістю у закладах вищої освіти авторами було визначено наступні: можливість підвищення їхнього престижу серед споживачів та перспективу підвищення рейтингових позицій закладів вищої освіти; забезпечення системи управління ресурсами та знаннями; постійний процес удосконалення діяльності закладів вищої освіти; забезпечення ефективного потоку інформації про поставлені завдання та їх виконання; удосконалення функціонування закладів вищої освіти та управління ним; швидке та ефективне вирішення проблем; уникнення помилок (а не їх

вирішення); зміна підходу до якості освіти; підвищення планово-бюджетної дисципліни; підвищення продуктивності та ефективності закладів вищої освіти; підвищення відповідальності, мотивації та відповідальності співробітників.

The paper focuses on the research of the process of implementation of the progressive approaches to quality management in HEIs, the experience of foreign countries in this direction. The stages of the process of creating a quality management system of ISO 9001-2000 in the modern universities, which are based on the researches of the experience of the foreign countries were studied by the authors. The comparative analysis of the list of factors, which are influencing on the quality of education in the context of studying the principles of TQM, EFQM criteria and the requirements of the international standard ISO 9001 was conducted. The main steps of the creation of quality management system in HEIs were analyzed by the authors, among of them are the next: creation of the team to formulate a quality policy and describe the main processes in the HEIs; training and motivation of the staff of the institution, training of quality commissioners, managers and auditors; development (design) of the system, allows you to effectively manage processes, actions and tasks at all levels; development of an internal audit system; implementation of a quality management system for the provision of educational services. The comparative analysis of approaches to the monitoring the quality of higher education in the most European countries and Ukraine is payed attention. The main benefits of implementing the quality management systems in HEIs were identified by the authors in particularly: the possibility of increasing their prestige among consumers and the prospect of increasing the rating position of HEIs; providing a resource and knowledge management system; constant process of improving the activity of the HEIs; guarantee of an effective information flow on the assigned tasks and their implementation; improving the functioning of the HEIs and its management; fast and effective problem solving; avoiding mistakes (not to solving them); changing

the approach to the quality of education; improving planning and budgetary discipline; increasing the productivity and efficiency of the HEIs; increased responsibility, motivation and commitment of employees.

Ключові слова: *менеджмент якості, заклади вищої освіти, навчальний процес, рейтингування, ISO 9001.*

Keywords: *quality management, higher education institutions, educational process, rating, ISO 9001.*

Statement of the problem and its connection with practical tasks. In the modern conditions of market economy, the level of development of any country, along with its geopolitical location, natural and climatic conditions, the availability of natural and biological resources, depend on the intellectual component of its population. This component, in turn, covers a wide range of importantly necessary directions for the prospects for the development of the state - its economic and social level, political stability and security of the population, the innovative orientation of the further development, the propensity for economic growth and the increased welfare, is an important element of the protection of its citizens, which are the main value of any country. Thus, in the context of globalization transformations and the prevalence of market conditions of economic management, the level of human capital development is extremely important, because for the main consumers interested in using human resources - employers, the component of knowledge, skills, employee talent, inclination to continuous learning, creativity, thinking, ingenuity become quite significant. This problem is especially acute now, when most of the developed countries of the world are moving to the new stage in their development - the forming of knowledge economy.

As foreign experience is shown, given to the highly competitive tertiary education is a powerful indicator of development and a high level of human capital, the Ukrainian economy needs to modernize the mechanisms of the national

higher education system through the comprehensive restructuring of the entire system, increasing investments in this area and interaction between participants in the educational process and subjects, need of the highly qualified personnel, namely, employers, in particular, to move from the stage of "de jure" interaction to "de facto", because the theoretical basis of training cannot fully provide the practical training, which, as a result, annually leads graduates are not adapted to the realities of the labour market, or, in other words, the lack of practical skills and training does not allow graduates to fully compete in the labour market. Therefore, the reform of personnel training by HEIs should be based, first of all, on strengthening cooperation with potential employers and preparing students for the need for constant self-development and self-education, because in the turbulent environment of competitive buildings, a specialist with a tendency to rapid retraining, constant improvement of the quality of their knowledge and skills is in demand in any field.

The purpose of the paper. Taking into account the need to improve the efficiency of quality management of educational services in Ukraine, it is important to study the experience of the developed countries of the world in the implementation of progressive approaches to quality management of the provision of educational services in HEIs.

Analysis of recent research and publications. The development of the concept of quality management in the provision of educational services in the European Union has a long history. Now, the European Higher Education Area has 47 member states that have joined the Bologna Process [1].

Thus, the problem of improving the quality of HEIs management is quite common and, given its defining component, the search for an acceptable and effective solution is possible only with the use of management models or quality management.

As O. Levchenko notes, by characterizing the process of introducing the modern approaches to managing the quality of educational services on the principles of total quality management, it is necessary to properly form an

appropriate quality system for HEIs. This system should be aimed not only at solving current problems of the quality of educational services, but above all at meeting the needs and expectations of both students and teaching staff, business leaders, employing graduates of an educational institution, or receiving advanced training and retraining services for their employers, as well as the local community [2].

Presentation of the main material of the study with a full justification of the obtained scientific results. As practice shows, one of the most common approaches to managing the quality of educational services in higher education is the Total Quality Management model (TQM), which provides for the participation of all personnel of an organization in the creation of the high-quality products or services at all stages of its life cycle, from the stage of marketing, design, production, operation, maintenance to disposal.

The TQM quality concept is based on such principles as: engaging top management and all personnel; customer orientation; process and system approach; continuous quality improvement; fact-based decision making; building partnerships with the suppliers [3].

In the universities of the USA, France, the Great Britain and other developed countries, the problem of total quality management is considered in three dimensions:

1. Teaching TQM as an independent academic discipline in the learning process both in the Western Higher Educational Establishment and in the process of university training.
2. Organization of teaching other disciplines using the principles and methods of TQM.
3. Organization of HEI management, which is based on the principles and methods of TQM.

The introduction to TQM begins by looking at the evolution of the concept of quality in accordance with four quality concepts: conformity to a standard;

conformity to using; compliance with the cost; compliance with hidden requirements.

In general, the TQM methodology has been applied in the field of higher education since the early 90s of the twentieth century. The result of the positive implementation of the principles of TQM in the activities of the HEIs in the developed countries and developing countries, has been an increasing in student performance, an improvement in the quality of educational programs, an increasing in the involvement of the teaching staff and staff of the HEI to improve the quality of the growth in demand for graduates of these HEIs.

According to the studies of the most researchers, there are certain advantages in creating a quality management system for HEIs in the context of the TQM ideology, which provides for the application of process and system principles. So, the systemic approach is based on the paradigm of quality management, based on the concept of intersystem connections and interactions, is considered as a set of interdependent elements of the external environment and internal structure of the enterprise.

The advantage of the process approach is to ensure the continuous monitoring of the relationships of individual processes within the system of interrelated and interdependent business processes, which are based on the implementation of the requirements of the ISO 9000-2000 series [3].

The using of DSTU ISO 9001-2000 to create a quality management system for the provision of educational services is not a one-time campaign, but a weighty and complex innovation. The creation of quality management system is a task that sometimes requires non-traditional approaches to its solution and provides for compliance with the principles of consistency, should occur through the implementation of tasks of interrelated stages. To do this, you need to adhere to the following sequence:

1. Creation of the team to formulate a quality policy and describe the main processes in the HEIs.

2. Training and motivation of the staff of the institution, training of quality commissioners, managers and auditors. It is important that each employee understands their role, responsibility and authority within the quality management system. A prerequisite is to attract students as the main consumers of educational services.

3. Development (design) of the system, allows you to effectively manage processes, actions and tasks at all levels.

4. Development of an internal audit system, which will allow assessing the degree of readiness of the structural units of the HEIs to work efficiently, in accordance with the requirements of DSTU ISO 9001-2000.

5. Implementation of a quality management system for the provision of educational services [3].

One of the main tasks of the third, fourth and fifth stages of the proposed sequence is the creation of the package of documents regulating the implementation of all processes in the quality management system for the provision of educational services.

The modern approaches to the creation or modernization of the quality management system for the provision of educational services provide for the mandatory creation by each educational institution of such documents as: information package ECTS; documented quality policy and objectives; installation; formalized in documents, methods, requires DSTU ISO 9001-2000, which sets out the policy, goals, mechanisms and criteria for the quality of educational services and methods that are used for this [3].

Another common approach to managing the quality of educational services in higher education is the introduction of the criteria of the European Foundation for Quality Management (in English - European Foundation for Quality Management, EFQM).

Five of them are "Opportunities" criteria, and the other four are "Results" criteria [4]. Criteria "Opportunities" characterize the potential of the organization, and "Results" - the results achieved [4].

The European Foundation for Quality Management in Higher Education model was developed by the University of Hallam Sheffield in the UK. Among the main advantages of the model for HEI are: understanding and foreseeing the needs of students and their expectations, demonstration of forward-looking leadership; attraction of employees; development of mutually beneficial relationships, etc. [4].

The list of factors, which are influencing on the quality of training in comparison with the principles of TQM, EFQM criteria and the requirements of the international standard ISO 9001 is shown in Table 1, gives the grounds for the conclusion that these factors fully correspond to the general ideology of TQM, on which, in fact, they are based.

Thus, the current state of the quality of higher education causes concern, which leads to the need to manage the quality of the provision of educational services by domestic HEIs

The study of the positive experience of developed countries, which are in the world rankings, and graduates are in demand in the labour market, in the implementation of the principles of General Quality Management in accordance with the requirements of the quality system ISO 9001:2000, allows us to state the need to implement these approaches in Ukrainian HEIs in order to increasing the competitiveness of graduates in the labour market in the national and international context.

As a result, on the part of state regulation, it is necessary to form a good mechanism for introducing the principles of Total Quality Management (TQM) in the activities of the HEI, to create a consulting committee for the implementation of approaches to education quality management under the Ministry of Education and Science, to facilitate the exchange of positive experience in the application of education quality management models with foreign The HEIs through holding round tables, conferences and seminars at the state level, as a result, will allow the heads of the HEIs of Ukraine to adopt the foreign experience in strengthening the competitive position of their graduates in the labour market [3].

Table 1. The top comparative characteristics of education quality management models in the context of factors, which are affecting on the quality of preparation of HEI

Factors, which influence on the quality of training	Principles of TQM	EFQM criteria	ISO 9001: 2000 requirements
Level of preparation of entrants	Orientation to the consumer. Establishing the mutually beneficial relationships with suppliers	Using of staff potential	7.3.2. Incoming data design and development
The level of training of professors, recruitment of personnel, improving their skills , level of social protection	The role of senior management. Involvement of staff	The role of senior management. Politics and strategy. Staff satisfaction	6.2. Human resources
Organization of the educational process, introduction of the scientific achievements into the educational process	Process approach	Management processes	7.2. Design and development 7.5. Production and provision of services
Equipped with training equipment, textbooks, manuals, computers and office equipment, using of information technology	Systemic approach	Rational using of resources	6.3. Infrastructure 6.4. Production environment
Humanization of education, extracurricular the educational activities	Process approach	Management processes	7.3.3. Initial data of design and development
Organization of independent work of students	Involvement of staff	Using of staff Potential	7.5. Production and provision of services
Motivation of students to quality education	Involvement of staff	Consumer Satisfaction	7.3.3. Initial data of design and development
Control of students' knowledge, skills and abilities	Making decisions based on facts	Management processes. Results of activities	8.2.4. Product monitoring and measurement 8.3. Non- compliant product management
Assessment of the level of student training by employers, society	Orientation to the consumer	Consumer satisfaction and society. Results of activities	8.2.1. Satisfaction customer
Level of Self-evaluation and improvement	Constant improvement	Results of activities	8.2.2. Internal audit 8.4. Data analysis 8.5. Improvement
Level of compliance with the state accreditation requirements	Orientation to the consumer	Consumer and society satisfaction. Results of activities	1.1. General provisions
How to contact with employers and alumni	Orientation to the consumer	Consumer and society satisfaction. Results of activities	7.2. The processes, which relate to customers 7.2.3. Communication with the customer
Organization of the continuing education	Constant improvement	Management processes. Results of activities	8. Measurement, analysis and improvement

Source: formed by the authors on the basis [3]

As Vetta notes, the transformational nature of higher education necessitates a change in the qualitative component. Firstly, the context, and secondly, the

stakeholders (the quality is associated with the specific stakeholders, within the framework of which the quality of each investigated stakeholders is considered separately).

In particular, the scientific researches of V. Wroyshtein, M. Middlehorst and D. Harvey and F. Green emphasize the importance and value of considering quality from different points of view of stakeholders [5].

The world practice has highlighted the various approaches to quality that can be applied within the framework of quality assurance systems. The quality institutions could be applied either a single approach or all in aggregate, according to different training systems and traditions [5].

There are three main approaches to determining a quality - accreditation, assessment and audit.

Accreditation is an assessment of whether an institution or program meets threshold standards and status. The obtaining accreditation can have implications for the HEI itself (for example, a permit to operate) and/or its students (for example, for receiving grants). Accreditation is complex and examines the mission, resources and the educational process directly in HEIs. Accreditation is a widely used quality assurance method in OECD countries. In the USA, accreditation of both programs and institutions is the main method of quality assurance. Accreditation of programs is regularly used by about half of the European educational quality agencies. The institutions are accredited regularly by about 22% of the European agencies, for example German, Austrian agencies and some in the associated countries. Accreditation procedures can be also focused on QAA; for example, one of the tasks of the German institution Accreditation is to carry out the accreditation of other institutions (ENQA, 2003).

Assessment is the formation of a certain quality score, based on the points that the HEI must comply with, in this respect it goes beyond accreditation, that is, it makes binary judgments.

Quality audit examines the extent to which an institution is achieving its own explicit or implicit goals, defines quality audit as a three-part process,

verifying: the conformity of planned quality procedures in accordance with stated goals; compliance of the quality of actual activities and plans; efficiency of activity in achieving the set goals”. The exit is a description of how correct the university's requirements are. The academic audits are conducted at the educational institution level. However, unlike accreditation or assessment, audits are not intended to provide a comprehensive overview of the resources and activities of the HEIs or programs, or directly assess the quality of training. On the contrary, the audit focuses on those who carry out the processes that are implemented by the HEIs in order to ensure and improve the quality of training. In Europe, the institutional auditing is regularly used by 28% of quality assurance institutions. It is used on the regular basis in Ireland and the UK, as well as some agencies in the Nordic and associated countries.

The using of program audits is not very common for the European education quality (ENQA, 2003).

Thus, the provision of monitoring the quality of higher education is a complex phenomenon. We consider it expedient to analyze approaches to monitoring the quality of higher education in the most European countries and Ukraine (Table 2).

As we can see from the table 2, Ukraine is characterized by the absolutely opposite approach to ensuring quality monitoring, which reflects the command-administrative foundations of its construction, contradicts the principles and approaches of world quality standards, their control and monitoring.

Conclusions from this study and prospects for further research in this direction. Thus, in modern conditions of the spread of the knowledge economy and the transition to the innovative model of the economy, improving the quality of higher education is becoming increasingly important, in particular, given the deepening of globalization processes in the educational space. Given this aspect, the tools and principles of quality management systems are becoming more and more popular to improve the quality of educational services in higher education institutions.

Table 2. The comparative analysis of approaches to monitoring the quality of higher education in the most European countries and Ukraine

Evaluation position	The European countries	Ukraine
Objects		
HEIs network	Branched, free zones of different types	Branched, free economic zones of different types and levels of accreditation
Form of ownership of HEIs	State (predominant), municipal , private	State (predominant), communal, private
Levels and subjects		
State subordination		
National	Conference of Ministers of Education , Ministry of Education	Ministry of Education
Regional	Ministry of Education of relevant regions / lands / districts	Department of Education of the Regional State Administration
	Conference of land rectorors	Board of Rectors of the region
Internal	Standing commissions by specialties	Rectorate
	Rectorate	Training department
Public initiative		
Public monitoring organizations	Influential independent agencies, employers' associations, rating companies, information resources	Single pilot projects
Priority of monitoring levels		
Monitoring levels	Individual Internal HEIs Regional National	National Regional Internal free economic zone Individual
Conceptual principles and features of the monitoring system		
Goal	Ensuring compliance with the European standards and continuous improvement of the quality of higher education	Quality control of higher education in accordance with the requirements of state educational standards
Orientation	Personality-social-state (determined by consumers of educational services, labour market needs)	State-administrative (determined by current legislation)
Principles	Autonomy of monitoring agencies, compatibility (with international monitoring bases), normative (international)	Centralization, state administration, compatibility (with state databases), regulations (state)
Procedure for monitoring the quality of higher education	Dynamic, variable, aimed at continuous improvement	Static, inadequate to the requirements of the time
Goal	Ensuring compliance with the European standards and continuous improvement of the quality of higher education	Quality control of higher education in accordance with the requirements of state educational standards

Source: formed by the authors on the basis [6]

Taking into account the basic requirements of ISO 9001, their implementation is fully consistent with the sustainable development of the education system. The decision on the responsibility of the management will lead to the implementation of quality control procedures, at a time when such requirements as monitoring and periodic review of programs, encouragement and assessment of students is the implementation of educational services. When

implementing resource management requirements, quality assurance issues for teaching staff, learning resources and student support standards are considered.

The process of implementing this kind of quality management systems is rather complicated, but it has many advantages. The HEIs, that have implemented a quality management system in accordance with the ISO 9001 standard appear to be reliable and reasonably organized. First of all, this is the possibility of increasing their prestige among consumers and the prospect of increasing the rating position of HEIs, directly depends on the advantages that the quality management system brings: providing a resource and knowledge management system; constant process of improving the activity of the HEIs; guarantee of an effective information flow on the assigned tasks and their implementation; improving the functioning of the HEIs and its management; fast and effective problem solving; To avoid mistakes (not to solve them); changing the approach to the quality of education; improving planning and budgetary discipline; increasing the productivity and efficiency of the HEIs; increased responsibility, motivation and commitment of employees.

Література

1. Bologna Declaration. Bologna: European Ministers of Education. URL: https://ec.europa.eu/education/policies/higher-education/bologna-process-and-european-higher-education-area_en
2. Левченко О. М. Напрями трансформації підходів до менеджменту якості освітніх послуг вищих навчальних закладів України. *Економіка і регіон*. 2011. № 2 (29). С. 113–117.
3. Царенко І. О. Зарубіжний досвід управління якістю надання освітніх послуг вищими навчальними закладами // Стратегія якості в промисловості та освіті: XI Міжнародна конференція (Варна, Болгарія, 1–5 червня 2015 р.). Варна, 2015. С. 289–297.
4. Model criteria. EFQM. URL: <http://www.efqm.org/efqm—model/model—criteria>.

5. Tsarenko I.O. The quality management system in educational institutions of Slovak Republic: Impact on the Ranking's position. *Міжнародний науковий економічний журнал «Бізнес Інформ»*. 2018. № 3. С. 71-80

6. Чорна О.В. Розвиток системи моніторингу якості вищої освіти у Німеччині: Дис. канд. пед. наук : 13.00.01. Східноукр. нац. ун-т. ім. В. Даля. Київ, 2016. 268 с.

References

1. European Education Area (2024), “Bologna Declaration. Bologna: European Ministers of Education”, available at: https://ec.europa.eu/education/policies/higher-education/bologna-process-and-european-higher-education-area_en (Accessed 4 Aug. 2024).

2. Levchenko, O. M. (2015), “Directions of transformation of approaches to quality management of educational services of higher educational institutions of Ukraine”, *Ekonomika i rehion*, vol. 2 (29). pp. 113–117.

3. Tsarenko, I. O. (2015), “Foreign experience of quality management of educational services provision by higher educational institutions”, *Stratehiia yakosti v promyslovosti ta osviti: XI Mizhnarodna konferentsiia* [Quality strategy in industry and education: XI International Conference], Varna, Bolhariia, pp. 289–297.

4. EFQM (2024), “Model criteria”, available at: <http://www.efqm.org/efqm—model/model—criteria> (Accessed 28 July 2024).

5. Tsarenko, I.O. (2018), “The quality management system in educational institutions of Slovak Republic: Impact on the Ranking's position”, *Mizhnarodnyi naukovyi ekonomichnyi zhurnal «Biznes Inform»*, vol. 3. pp. 71-80.

6. Chorna, O.V. (2016), “Development of the higher education quality monitoring system in Germany”, Ph.D. dissertation, General pedagogy and history of pedagogy, Eastern Ukraine national Univ. named after V. Dalya, Kyiv, Ukraine.

Стаття надійшла до редакції 09.08.2024 р.